

Brincat Anna at Parlament-MT

From: Deguara Charles at NAO
Sent: Thursday, 09 May 2024 15:13
To: Brincat Anna at Parlament-MT
Cc: Darren Carabott; Muscat Alexander at Parlament-MT
Subject: RE: Re: Informazzjoni mitluba mill-Kumitat Permanenti dwar il-Kontijiet Pubbliċi
Attachments: Malta National Shooting Range - Replies to PAC queries as sent 09 05 24.docx

Sa Brincat,

Qed nibgħatlek ir-risposti tal-awdituri tagħna għall-mistoqsijiet li ġew magħmula mill-membri tal-PAC fis-seduta tas-7 ta' Mejju 2024.

Tislijiet,

Charles

Charles Deguara

B.A. (Hons) Business Management, CIPFA Hon

Auditor General

National Audit Office

Notre Dame Ravelin, Floriana FRN 1601, Malta



Email: charles.deguara@gov.mt

Office: +356 22055000

Direct: +356 22055001



Please read our Legal Notice: <http://www.nao.gov.mt/emailpolicy>

Kindly consider your environmental responsibility before printing this e-mail.

From: Brincat Anna at Parlament-MT <anna.brincat@parlament.mt>
Sent: Wednesday, May 8, 2024 10:03 AM
To: Deguara Charles at NAO <charles.deguara@gov.mt>
Cc: Darren Carabott <carabottdarren@gmail.com>; Muscat Alexander at Parlament-MT <alexander.muscat@parlament.mt>
Subject: Re: Informazzjoni mitluba mill-Kumitat Permanenti dwar il-Kontijiet Pubbliċi

Is-Sur Charles Deguara
Awditur Ġenerali

Ippermettili nfakkrek li waqt il-laqgħa tal-Kumitat Permanenti dwar il-Kontijiet Pubbliċi, li saret ilbieraħ 7 ta' Mejju, waqt id-diskussjoni rigward il-parti tar-Rapport tal-Awditur Ġenerali dwar il-Kontijiet Pubbliċi

għas-sena 2019 li titratta l-Malta National Shooting Range, l-Uffiċċju tiegħek gie mitlub jipprovdi din l-informazzjoni:

- Jekk l-Uffiċċju ngħatax kopja tal-minuti tal-progress meetings imsemmija fil-“key issues”, u jekk iva tistgħux tipprovdu kopja tagħhom lill-Kumitat;
- X’kienet il-conflicting information li ngħatat;
- X’kienet il-korrispondenza li l-Uffiċċju ma ngħatax risposta għaliha;
- Jekk l-Uffiċċju daħalx fuq il-mod kif intagħżel il-kuntrattur; u
- L-ismijiet tal-persuni li l-Uffiċċju tkellem magħhom matul l-audit li sar.

Filwaqt li niringrazzjak, inselli għalik.

Anna

Anna Brincat

Clerk to the Public Accounts Committee
Standing Committee for the Environment, Climate Change and Development Planning
National Audit Office Accounts Committee

t: +356 25596308 e: anna.brincat@parlament.mt | www.parlament.mt

Kindly consider your environmental responsibility before printing this e-mail



HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES
PARLIAMENT OF MALTA
FREEDOM SQUARE, VALLETTA, MALTA

Malta National Shooting Range – Annual Audit Report 2019

- Jekk l-Uffiċċju ngħatax kopja tal-minuti tal-progress meetings imsemmija fil- “key issues”, u jekk iva tistgħux tipprovdu kopja tagħhom lill-Kumitat;

NAO did not request this information, since expenditure related to the services provided by the Project Manager did not fall within the audit sample.

- X’kienet il-conflicting information li ngħatat;

The following are examples of conflicting information, relating to the timeline of project works:

- *According to the Project Manager, the commencement date for works on the alterations and finishing works on the clubhouse building contract was 8 January 2018 and substantial completion of works seems to have been achieved on 25 March 2018. The only updated workplan available¹ indicated that work commenced on 15 January and was planned to be completed by 14 March. On the other hand, the order to start works, as per email sent by the Project Manager, was reckoned to be as from 11 December 2017.*
- *With regards to the construction and finishing of the spectators’ stand, the Works Programme² forwarded by the Projects Manager indicated 21 November to 28 December 2017 as the period of execution. The Manager also claimed that no records were traced which state that the construction was not completed in the six-week period indicated in the programme. On the other hand, SportMalta’s reply to the same query stated that the dates on the Work Programme were just a plan and the period of execution started after the signing of the respective contract, i.e. after 18 March 2018. The Quantity Surveyors also verbally claimed that the spectators’ stand was constructed in March 2018.*
- *Following NAO’s query on the period of execution of the construction of the berm wall and foundations contract, the Project Manager forwarded the pertinent documentation which he could trace. This included a Progress of Works Report dated 20 December 2017 and a Programme of Works dated 7 February 2018. The former document³ indicated an execution period of between 4 December 2017 and 26 March 2018, whilst the latter document showed that works were to be carried out between February and mid-March. On the other hand, the order to start works, as per email sent by the Project Manager, was reckoned to be 11 December 2017.*

- X’kienet il-korrispondenza li l-Uffiċċju ma ngħatax risposta għaliha;

Documentation not made available for audit purposes included acceptance certificates, notification to commence work and work registers. As noted in the Key Issue (Weak Internal Controls) and Control Issue, these were either not traced or not compiled in the first place.

¹ Dated 9 February 2018.

² Dated 11 December 2017.

³ NAO could not place reliance on this document, since a number of entries in this report included a question mark sign next to the duration in days.

- Jekk l-Uffiċċju daħalx fuq il-mod kif intaġġel il-kuntrattur;

NAO reviewed the procurement processes leading to the awarding of the three sampled contracts. The respective concerns were reported in the Annual Audit Report 2019.

- L-ismijiet tal-persuni li l-Uffiċċju tkellem magħhom matul l-audit li sar.

The main contact persons during the audit were Denise Sultana De Raffaele (Director Finance) and Maria Seychell (Accounts Manager). NAO also held meetings with Frank Fabri (former Ministry for Education and Employment Permanent Secretary), Mark Cutajar (SportMalta CEO), Jesmar Degabriele (Procurement Support Officer), Mark Anthony Debono (MTIP Quantity Surveyor) and Joseph Grech (MTIP Head Quantity Surveying Unit).