



18 ta' Lulju 2023

L-Onor. Dr Anġlu Farrugia
President tal-Kumitat Permanenti
dwar l-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

Bl-email permezz tal-Iskrivan tal-Kamra

Mr Speaker,

**Rakkomandazzjoni taħt l-artikolu 13(1)(g)
tal-Att dwar Standards fil-Ħajja Pubblika**

Nirreferi għal-laqgħa tat-28 ta' Ġunju 2023 tal-Kumitat Permanenti dwar l-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika, fejn il-Kumitat iddeċieda li m'għandux jadotta r-rapport ta' dan l-Uffiċċju dwar il-każ K/041.

Nosserva li inti bbażajt il-vot deċiżiv tiegħek f'dik il-laqgħa fuq il-fatt li l-linji gwida intitolati *Guidelines on Government Advertising and Promotional Material*, maħruġa minn dan l-Uffiċċju fit-2 ta' Awwissu 2021, m'għandhomx saħħa legali, għalkemm għedt ukoll li taqbel mal-kontenut tagħhom.¹

Nerġa' ntenni dak li qal il-Kummissarju preċedenti, u dak li kkonfermajt jien f'każ deċiż minni. Dawn il-linji gwida ma jirrappreżentawx regoli ġodda fihom infushom iżda biss indikazzjoni dwar kif għandhom jiġu interpretati r-regoli eżistenti tal-etika f'każi li jinvolvu riklami jew materjal promozzjonali mħallas minn fondi pubbliċi.²

Nosserva wkoll li f'każ preċedenti inti kont astjenejt milli tagħti vot deċiżiv għaliex ħassejt li l-Kodiċi ta' Etika għall-Ministri u Segretarji Parlamentari ma

¹ Motivazzjoni tal-vot tal-Ispeaker tat-28 ta' Ġunju 2023 dwar il-każ K/041, paġni 4–6.

² Ittra mibgħuta mill-Kummissarju għall-Istandards preċedenti lid-deputati parlamentari kollha fis-6 ta' Awwissu 2021; u rapport dwar il-każ K/045, maħruġ minni fl-14 ta' April 2023.



kienx biżżejjed bħala bażi biex jiġi deċiż il-każ, u kont għedt li “*għandu jkun hemm guidelines anke dwar kif jiġu magħmula l-adverts. Dan sabiex jiġu stabbiliti kriterji ċari li wieħed għandu jimxi fuqhom biex ikun aktar konfortat illi b’dak li qed jagħmel ma jkunx b’xi mod qed jikser xi regolament tal-istess Kodiċi ta’ Etika.*”³ Kien dan il-każ li wassal għat-tfassil tal-linji gwida.

Fiz-żewġ każi l-Kumitat interpreta d-dispożizzjonijiet rilevanti b’mod ristrett iżżejjed, bħallikieku kien qed japplika l-prinċipji tal-ligi kriminali għall-kamp tal-etika. Fil-fehma tiegħi, dan mhux korrett. L-Att dwar Standards fil-Ħajja Pubblika juri b’mod ċar li allegazzjonijiet ta’ ksur ta’ etika m’għandhomx jiġu trattati qishom akkużi kriminali. L-implikazzjonijiet u r-reperkussjonijiet ta’ allegazzjoni ta’ ksur ta’ etika u allegazzjoni ta’ reat huma għal kollox differenti u m’għandhomx jiġu ttrattati jew regolati bl-istess mod. L-etika tmur lil hinn mill-osservanza stretta tal-ligi.

Jekk wieħed iqis dawn iż-żewġ każi bħala precedent, ifisser li l-Kumitat dwar l-Istandards la hu lest jistrieħ fuq il-kodiċi ta’ etika ministerjali u lanqas ma huwa lest jirreferi għal-linji gwida huwa u jikkunsidra allegazzjonijiet ta’ ksur ta’ etika marbuta ma’ riklami mħallsa minn fondi pubbliċi. B’hekk il-Kumitat effettivament ħoloq sitwazzjoni fejn huwa ma jistax jieħu azzjoni kontra tali ksur. Din is-sitwazzjoni għandha tiġi indirizzata b’urgenza.

L-artikolu 13(1)(g)(i) tal-istess Att jagħti s-setgħa lill-Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika li “*jagħmel rakkomandazzjonijiet għat-titjib ta’ kull Kodiċi ta’ Etika li jkun japplika għal persuni li jkunu soġġetti għal dan l-Att*”.

Għalhekk, permezz ta’ din l-ittra qiegħed nirrakkomanda formalment li l-paragrafi 1.10 sa 3.11 tad-dokument intitolat *Guidelines on Government Advertising and Promotional Material*, anness ma’ din l-ittra, għandhom jingħataw ix-xejra ta’ regoli u jiġu nkluzi fit-tieni skeda tal-Att dwar Standards fil-Ħajja Pubblika bħala addenda għall-kodiċi ta’ etika ministerjali. B’hekk il-linji gwida jingħataw bażi legali u jiġi eliminat kull dubju dwar il-validità tagħhom.

Skont l-artikolu 3(4) tal-Att, dan jeħtieġ ordni fil-Gazzetta tal-Gvern maħruġa mill-Ministru għall-Ġustizzja fuq rakkomandazzjoni tal-Kumitat dwar l-

³ Motivazzjoni tal-vot tal-Ispeaker tat-28 ta’ April 2021 dwar il-każ K/028, paġna 7.



Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika, imsaħħa b'riżoluzzjoni affermattiva tal-Kamra tad-Deputati. Qiegħed nindirizza din ir-rakkomandazzjoni lill-Kumitat bil-għan li jagħti bidu għall-proċess imsemmi fl-artikolu 3(4).

Din l-ittra se tiġi ppubblikata minn dan l-Uffiċċju.

Insellimlek,

Prim Imħallef Emeritu Joseph Azzopardi
Uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika



Guidelines on Government Advertising and Promotional Material

*Issued by the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
on 2 August 2021*



Commissioner for Standards
in Public Life

Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
11, St Paul Street, Valletta VLT 1210, Malta

www.standardscommissioner.com
office@standardscommissioner.com
+356 27 269 593

Guidelines on Government Advertising and Promotional Material

1 Introduction

Purpose of these guidelines

- 1.1 These guidelines have been drawn up by the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life (“the Commissioner”) for the guidance of ministers with a view to avoiding the inappropriate use of public funds in the production, publication or distribution of advertising and promotional material by or for the government.
- 1.2 These guidelines are an amended version of the guidelines that were issued in draft form by the Commissioner for consultation purposes on 22 June 2021. These guidelines are now in force and will be applied by the Commissioner in relevant cases.

Relationship between these guidelines and the ministerial code of ethics

- 1.3 These guidelines do not set out new rules. They indicate how the Commissioner will interpret the Code of Ethics for Ministers and Parliamentary Secretaries (“the Ministerial Code”), which constitutes the second schedule of the Standards in Public Life Act (“the Act”), in connection with government advertising and promotional material. The guidelines are intended to establish predictability in this area especially since there are no precedents to follow, given that the Ministerial Code was not meaningfully enforced prior to October 2018 when the Act was brought into force.
- 1.4 Specifically, these guidelines concern the application of articles 4.9, 4.10, 5.3, 5.6, 5.7 and 7.4 of the Ministerial Code to government advertising and promotional material. The articles in question state as follows:

4.9 Ministers shall keep their roles as Ministers and as Representatives separate, as well as their role as a member of a political party.

4.10 Ministers shall respect the principle of political impartiality of the public service.

5.3 Diligence – once Ministers administer public property, on behalf of the public in general, they shall exercise the highest level of diligence including in the expenditure of public funds, and they shall also work diligently and hard in the performance of their duties.

5.6 Transparency – Ministers shall as much as possible perform their duties in an open and transparent manner, and therefore give reasons for their decisions and actions.

5.7 Honesty – Ministers shall avoid entering into conflicts of interest between the public interest and their private interest and shall provide complete and correct information to Parliament, to the Cabinet and the public in general.

7.4 Ministers shall respect the impartiality of the public service and shall ensure that their influence on the public service is not abused. [...]

- 1.5 These guidelines do not cover all situations that might possibly arise, and the absence of guidelines on any matter does not exonerate ministers from their obligation to observe the Ministerial Code in all circumstances. The Commissioner will continue to consider alleged breaches of ethics that are not covered by these guidelines with direct reference to the Ministerial Code and the Act.

Relationship between these guidelines and the code of ethics for persons of trust

- 1.6 Persons of trust (as defined by article 2 of the Act) are also subject to investigation by the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life. It is conceivable that cases concerning government advertising and promotional material might involve persons of trust, since they may act on behalf of ministers in commissioning the production, publication or distribution of such material.
- 1.7 Persons of trust are bound by the Code of Ethics for Public Employees and Board Members, which is set out in the first schedule of the Public Administration Act. Among other things, this code obliges persons of trust to –
- *“use public resources appropriately, conscientiously, efficiently and effectively in the public interest” – paragraph 9(b);*
 - *“act in such a way as to gain and, or maintain the trust of their superiors and the public” – paragraph 16(a); and*
 - *“act in a manner that is transparent and in compliance with applicable laws, regulations, directives, policies and procedures” – paragraph 19(a).*
- 1.8 The Commissioner will interpret the Code of Ethics for Public Employees and Board Members in the light of these guidelines in any cases concerning persons of trust who are involved in the production, publication or distribution of government advertising and promotional material. The disclaimer set out in paragraph 1.5 of these guidelines applies also to the observance by persons of trust of their ethical obligations.

Interpretation of the term “minister”

- 1.9 In these guidelines, the term “minister” includes the Prime Minister, ministers and parliamentary secretaries.

General principles

- 1.10 It is acknowledged that the government has a wide discretion in the use of public funds to fulfil its duty to communicate with the public, in order to serve purposes such as the following:

- to provide information about matters of public interest;
- to encourage take-up of a particular public service;
- to contribute to public safety or encourage responsible behaviour;
- to promote the awareness of rights or entitlements; and
- to contribute to economic growth, for instance by promoting investment or tourism.

- 1.11 In addition, government advertising may be used to indirectly support the media in a fair and transparent manner, in recognition of its vital role in a democratic society.

- 1.12 Government advertising and promotional material should only be used to serve public purposes such as these.

- 1.13 Whilst this should not be the purpose of government advertising, it is acknowledged that the party in government in general and ministers in particular may derive an indirect benefit from government advertisements and promotional material that also serve legitimate public purposes. However, there is a line that should not be crossed. These guidelines seek to define that line, that is to say, the principle that government advertisements and promotional material should not be produced to serve private or partisan political purposes.

2 Communications to which these guidelines apply

- 2.1 These guidelines distinguish between government advertising and government promotional material. Each term is defined below.

Government advertising

- 2.2 In these guidelines, “government advertising” means the publication of communications –

- (a) against direct or indirect payment by a ministry or a government department, agency, entity or other body for which a minister is responsible; and
- (b) in any medium including printed matter, broadcasting by means of wireless telegraphy or wire or both, and electronic media.

2.3 *Inter alia*, government advertising may include:

- (a) inserts and supplements in publications in print and online;
- (b) billboards;
- (c) boosted or sponsored posts on social media;
- (d) advertorials, that is to say articles or opinion pieces that include more content than a normal advertisement but are still placed against payment; and
- (e) sponsored interviews, features, and TV/radio/podcast spots and broadcast programmes in which the sponsor determines the interview questions or programme content.

2.4 Communications that are normally published against payment, but which are not on any particular occasion, are still covered by these guidelines. These may include opinion pieces, features or video clips that are ostensibly carried without charge by media houses but are in fact part of a paid package.

Government promotional material

2.5 In these guidelines, “government promotional material” means any material that:

- (a) is intended to promote a particular cause, initiative, entity, or brand; and
- (b) is produced against direct or indirect payment by a ministry or a government department, agency, entity or other body for which a minister is responsible.

2.6 *Inter alia*, government promotional material may consist of the following:

- (a) leaflets, brochures, flyers, and other stand-alone publications that are intended for distribution by post at no cost to the recipient;
- (b) calendars, diaries, stationery, and other items intended for distribution for promotional purposes;
- (c) items intended to be given as gifts, such as food hampers, and accompanying material such as cards or compliment slips;
- (d) greeting cards, e.g. Christmas, birthday and Mother’s Day cards;
- (e) bulk emails and bulk text messaging;
- (f) videos, graphics, documents and audio clips that are produced for circulation to the public by electronic means; and

- (g) videos, graphics, posters and other material that is produced for presentation or display in particular venues.

Exclusions

- 2.7 The following are not considered to be government advertising or promotional material for the purpose of these guidelines:
 - (a) posts on official social media sites, given that such posts are covered by separate guidelines¹ (however, the present guidelines still apply to sponsored or boosted social media posts and to videos, graphics, documents and audio clips that are circulated by means of social media posts); and
 - (b) press releases and official statements.
- 2.8 The exclusion of these items does not mean that they are not subject to ethical standards. Ministers and other persons overseeing the dissemination of content by these means are still required to adhere to the relevant provisions of the code of ethics by which they are bound.

3 Rules applying to government advertising and promotional material

Content should be respectful

- 3.1 Government advertisements and promotional material should not include statements that are disrespectful towards third parties or overly contentious.

Content should be factual

- 3.2 Government advertisements and promotional material should not include statements that are untrue.

Content should be non-partisan

- 3.3 Government advertisements and promotional material should not include any content that is of a partisan nature.
- 3.4 In particular, government advertisements and promotional material should not:
 - (a) refer to a political party;
 - (b) include images or slogans used by a political party or individual politicians; or

¹ <https://standardscommissioner.com/wp-content/uploads/Commissioner-for-Standards-case-report-K010.pdf>, p. 18.

- (c) make reference to the websites of politicians or political parties, or to partisan social media pages.

Restriction on the use of the names and photographs of ministers

- 3.5 Government advertisements, as distinct from promotional material, should not include the names or photographs of ministers.
- 3.6 Government promotional material should not include the names or photographs of ministers, except as indicated in paragraph 3.7 in the case of:
 - (a) leaflets, brochures, flyers and other documents; and
 - (b) videos and audio clips.
- 3.7 A publication of the kind mentioned in paragraph 3.6(a) or 3.6(b) may include content referring to ministers, provided that –
 - (a) such content is relevant to the publication and contributes to the achievement of its legitimate objectives;
 - (b) such content is limited in relation to the rest of the content in the same publication, so as to avoid giving reasonable grounds for belief that the true aim of the publication is to promote the minister; and
 - (c) the publication is not circulated or broadcast against payment, or by means that would normally require payment, such that it would qualify as an advertisement for the purposes of these guidelines.

Proportionality

- 3.8 The use of government advertisements and promotional material should not be excessive or extravagant in relation to the intended objective.
- 3.9 The message communicated by a government advertisement should be of sufficient relevance to justify the public funds spent on it.

Transparency

- 3.10 Government advertisements and promotional material should carry official logos or otherwise make it clear that they have been produced by or for the government. This applies in particular to advertorials and sponsored interviews or programmes and any paid content. The public should be made aware that such articles have been paid for with public funds. Government-sponsored publications should carry a declaration to that effect.

Distribution of advertisements

- 3.11 Public funding should be directed to the media for advertising purposes on the basis of fair and objective criteria.

4 Negative clearance

- 4.1 Ministers may seek a decision by the Commissioner under article 13(1)(c) of the Act as to whether or not any advertisement or promotional material that is intended by them would be in keeping with these guidelines.
- 4.2 The Commissioner will be bound to respond within two working days from such a request. The Commissioner will follow up a negative decision with a statement of his reasons within ten working days from the date of the decision.